ESG Matters - Global

Bull market phenomenon? Quite the contrary
Thematic Investing

This is a redacted version of the original Primer Report, published March 25, 2020

“ESG is a bull market luxury” say the critics

A critique of the recent, intense focus on environmental, social and governance (ESG) attributes in investing is that this framework is a “nice to have” and not a “need to have” feature of investors’ noblesse oblige; but that in times of stress, investors and companies will reallocate all resources to simply staying afloat. Our contention has been that ESG is even more critical during a downturn, and recent evidence supports this.

5-10ppt alpha in US & Europe since peak; ESG inflows

From the S&P 500’s peak to today, stocks in the top quintile ESG ranks outperformed the market by over 5ppt. And this was not just due to less Energy or small cap exposure, we saw nearly identical results on a sector- and size-adjusted basis. In Europe, ESG indices outperformed their benchmarks year-to-date (YTD), and the top 50 most overweighted stocks by ESG funds have outperformed the most underweighted by more than 10ppt YTD. Moreover, ESG funds are still tracking YTD inflows versus record outflows in equity ETFs.

In Asia, COVID-19 containment trumps ESG scores

ESG performance has not correlated to better scores in Asia, which is largely explained by country biases: Greater China and India have outperformed Australia and Japan, despite having lower scores, perhaps in part due to COVID-19 timing/containment, as some argue that an emphasis on human rights may be a detriment to efficient quarantine measures. Our analysts also found evidence that factors like age cohorts, smokers hospital beds etc. are stronger drivers of COVID-19 management than traditional governance scores.

Higher EPS cuts for riskier stocks across all regions

Regardless of performance, lower-ranked ESG companies in the US, Europe and Asia have seen larger downward earnings revisions for 2020 / 2021 expectations than higher ranked companies. This was particularly evident in Discretionary, Tech, REITs & Utilities.

The “S” matters during social distancing pandemics

Social factors appear to carry heightened importance today: a track record of good employer/employee relations; safe, reliable branded products, and good workforce policies (including aspects like leave and childcare) have driven stock dispersion, more than good governance (which was most critical in the 08/09 financial crisis). Employee satisfaction is also important – possibly a signal of loyalty during a downturn – where stocks with high Glassdoor.com ratings outperformed by 5ppt in the recent selloff.

In a credit crunch, Green bonds, sovereigns show strength

In the recent selloff, green bonds have fallen less than their Euro-denominated Single A counterparts, with outperformance driven by the green bonds in the top quartile of ESG ratings. And in emerging market (EM) sovereign debt, higher ESG scores have exhibited much lower price volatility. ESG ranks are very correlated with sovereign ratings, and improving ESG often means improving credit stories – a critical factor in bear markets.

>> Employed by a non-US affiliate of BofA and is not registered/qualified as a research analyst under the FINRA rules.

Refer to “Other Important Disclosures” for information on certain BofA Securities entities that take responsibility for the information herein in particular jurisdictions.

BofA Securities does and seeks to do business with issuers covered in its research reports. As a result, investors should be aware that the firm may have a conflict of interest that could affect the objectivity of this report. Investors should consider this report as only a single factor in making their investment decision.

Refer to important disclosures on page 5 to 7.
ESG = a bear market phenomenon

A critique of the recent, intense focus on Environmental, Social and Governance (ESG) attributes in investing is that this framework is a “nice to have” not a “need to have” feature of investors’ noblesse oblige; but that in times of stress, investors and companies will reallocate all resources to simply staying afloat. Our contention has been that ESG (especially sector/region-specific) factors are more critical drivers of risks during a downturn than during rosier periods.

ESG factors have been reliable signals of bankruptcy risk in prior crises. See ABCs of ESG.

Recent flow trends indicate that ESG may be more of a bear market phenomenon: our BofA Securities client flows data indicated record ETF selling over the last few weeks (Chart 1), but ESG funds have seen inflows for ten straight weeks (Chart 2). Even after the market selloff, ESG ETF assets under management (AUM) are still up nearly 5% year-to-date, while S&P 500 ETFs have seen AUM decline by over 30%. In Europe, ESG funds have seen persistent inflows including recent weeks, even amid EU stock outflows.

**Chart 1: Record ETF selling**

BofA Securities clients’ rolling 4wk ETF flows ($mn, Jan 2008-3/20/2020)

---

**Chart 2: except in ESG funds**

Weekly and rolling 12wk flows into ESG funds ($mn, 1/2014-3/18/2020)

---

**Chart 3: ESG ETF assets under management are still up YTD and with less outflows in the selloff**

---

**Chart 4: European-focused ESG funds continue to gain assets even during the downturn**

---

Source: BofA Securities, BofA Global Research

Source: BofA US Equity & Quant Strategy, SimFund

Source: BofA Global Research, Bloomberg

Source: BofA European Equity Strategy, EPFR
ESG = alpha in a downturn

ESG can also generate alpha during market selloffs. Stocks ranked highly on ESG (top quintile) outperformed those that ranked poorly during both the market selloff in 4Q18 and today (Chart 5). Since the S&P 500's peak in February, stocks in the top quintile by ESG ranks outperformed the market by over 5ppt. Even adjusting for size and sector performance, highly-ranked ESG stocks outperformed the S&P 500 by 3-4ppt. In Europe, ESG indices outperformed their corresponding benchmarks year to date, and the top-50 most overweighted stocks by ESG funds have outperformed the most underweighted by more than 10ppt YTD, especially during the selloff.

Chart 5: Highly-ranked ESG stocks have outperformed the S&P 500... Performance of top quintile ESG-ranked stocks (Sustainalytics) vs. the equal-weighted S&P 500 universe since 4Q18

Chart 6: ...and especially during the recent market selloff YTD performance of top quintile ESG-ranked stocks (Sustainalytics) vs. the equal-weighted S&P 500 universe

Chart 7: European stocks owned by ESG funds also outperformed during the bear market

Chart 8: ESG indices in Europe fell less than their corresponding regional indices

Similarly, S&P 500 stocks most held by ESG funds have meaningfully outperformed those neglected by ESG funds during the most recent selloff, while the opposite was true for overweight / underweight stocks among long-only and hedge funds.
Chart 9: US stocks most owned by ESG funds saw superior returns to those least owned

Performance from February 19-March 20, 2020

Source: FactSet Ownership, BofA US Equity & Quant Strategy
Back tested performance is hypothetical in nature and reflects application of the screen and is not intended to be indicative of future performance.

See tables 1-3 in the Appendix for screens stocks most overweighted / widely owned by ESG funds

The Asia exception

ESG performance has not correlated to better scores in Asia, which is largely explained by country biases: Greater China and India have outperformed Australia and Japan, despite having lower scores, perhaps in part because of COVID-19 timing/containment, where some argue that an emphasis on human rights may be a detriment to efficient quarantine measures. In REITs and Utilities sector, we find companies with lower ESG scores have higher gearing.

Our analysts also found evidence that, at a country level, factors like age cohorts, smokers/diabetics, ratios of hospital beds etc. are stronger drivers of containment than traditional governance scores.
Disclosures

Important Disclosures

Due to the nature of strategic analysis, the issuers or securities recommended or discussed in this report are not continuously followed. Accordingly, investors must regard this report as providing standalone analysis and should not expect continuing analysis or additional reports relating to such issuers and/or securities.

Due to the nature of quantitative analysis, the issuers or securities recommended or discussed in this report are not continuously followed. Accordingly, investors must regard this report as providing standalone analysis and should not expect continuing analysis or additional reports relating to such issuers and/or securities.

BoFA Global Research personnel (including the analyst(s) responsible for this report) receive compensation based upon, among other factors, the overall profitability of Bank of America Corporation, including profits derived from investment banking. The analyst(s) responsible for this report may also receive compensation based upon, among other factors, the overall profitability of the Bank’s sales and trading businesses relating to the class of securities or financial instruments for which such analyst is responsible.

Other Important Disclosures

From time to time research analysts conduct site visits of covered issuers. BoFA Global Research policies prohibit research analysts from accepting payment or reimbursement for travel expenses from the issuer for such visits.

Prices are indicative and for information purposes only. Except as otherwise stated in the report, for the purpose of any recommendation in relation to: (i) an equity security, the price referenced is the publicly traded price of the security as of close of business on the day prior to the date of the report or, if the report is published during intraday trading, the price referenced is indicative of the traded price as of the date and time of the report; or (ii) a debt security (including equity preferred and CDS), prices are indicative as of the date and time of the report and are derived from various sources including BoFA Securities trading desks.

The date and time of completion of the production of any recommendation in this report shall be the date and time of dissemination of this report as recorded in the report timestamp.

This report may refer to fixed income securities or other financial instruments that may not be offered or sold in one or more states or jurisdictions, or to certain categories of investors, including retail investors. Readers of this report are advised that any discussion, recommendation or other mention of such instruments is not a solicitation or offer to transact in such instruments. Investors should contact their BoFA Merrill Lynch representative or Merrill Lynch Global Wealth Management financial advisor for information relating to such instruments.

Officers of BoFA or one or more of its affiliates (other than research analysts) may have a financial interest in securities of the issuer(s) or in related investments.

BoFA Global Research policies relating to conflicts of interest are described at https://lnch.bamll.com/coa.

“BoFA Securities” includes BoFA Securities, Inc. (“BoFA”) and its affiliates. Investors should contact their BoFA Securities representative or Merrill Lynch Global Wealth Management financial advisor if they have questions concerning this report or regarding the appropriateness of any investment idea described herein for such investor. “BoFA Securities” is a global brand for BoFA Global Research.

Information relating to non-US affiliates of BoFA Securities and Distribution of Affiliate Research Reports:

BoFA and/or Merrill Lynch, Pierce, Fenner & Smith (“MLPF&S”) may in the future distribute, information of the following non-US affiliates in the US (short name legal name, local, regulator): Merrill Lynch (South Africa): Merrill Lynch South Africa (Pty) Ltd, regulated by The Financial Service Board, ML (UK): Merrill Lynch International, regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority (FCA) and the Prudential Regulation Authority (PRA); BoFASE (France). BoFA Securities Europe SA is authorized by the Autorité de Contrôle Prudentiel et de Résolution (ACPR) and regulated by the ACPR and the Autorité des Marchés Financiers (AMF); BAMU DAC (Milan): Bank of America Merrill Lynch International DAC, Milan Branch, regulated by the Bank of Italy, the European Central Bank (ECB) and the Central Bank of Ireland (CBI); BAMU DAC (Frankfurt): Bank of America Merrill Lynch International DAC, Frankfurt Branch regulated by BaFin, the ECB and the CBI; Merrill Lynch (Australia): Merrill Lynch Equities (Australia) Limited, regulated by the Australian Securities and Investments Commission; Merrill Lynch Hong Kong: Merrill Lynch (Hong Kong); Merrill Lynch (Asia Pacific) Limited, regulated by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission (HKSCF); Merrill Lynch (Singapore): Merrill Lynch (Singapore) Pte Ltd, regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore (MAS); Merrill Lynch (Canada): Merrill Lynch Canada Inc; regulated by the Investment Industry Regulatory Organization of Canada; Merrill Lynch (Mexico): Merrill Lynch Mexico, SA de CV, Casa de Bolsa, regulated by the Comisión Nacional Bancaria y de Valores; Merrill Lynch (Argentina): Merrill Lynch Argentina SA, regulated by Comisión Nacional de Valores; Merrill Lynch (Japan): Merrill Lynch Japan Securities Co., Ltd., regulated by the Financial Services Agency; Merrill Lynch (Seoul): Merrill Lynch International, LLC Seoul Branch, regulated by the Financial Supervisory Service; Merrill Lynch (Taiwan): Merrill Lynch Securities (Taiwan) Ltd., regulated by the Securities and Futures Bureau; DSP Merrill Lynch (India): DSP Merrill Lynch Limited, regulated by the Securities and Exchange Board of India; Merrill Lynch (Indonesia): PT Merrill Lynch Sekuritas Indonesia, regulated by Otoritas Jasa Keuangan (OJK); Merrill Lynch (Israel): Merrill Lynch Israel Limited, regulated by Israel Securities Authority; Merrill Lynch (Russia): OOO Merrill Lynch Securities, Moscow, regulated by the Central Bank of the Russian Federation Merrill Lynch (DIFC): Merrill Lynch International (DIFC) Branch, regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (DFSA); Merrill Lynch (Spain): Merrill Lynch Capital Markets España, S.A.S.V., regulated by Comisión Nacional del Mercado De Valores, Merrill Lynch (Brazil): Merrill Lynch S.A. Corretora de Títulos e Valores Mobiliários, regulated by Comisión de Valores Mobiliarios, Merrill Lynch RSA Company: Merrill Lynch Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Company, regulated by the Capital Market Authority.

This information has been approved for publication and is distributed within the United Kingdom (UK) to professional clients and eligible counterparties (as each is defined in the rules of the FCA and the PRA) by ML (UK), which is authorized by the FCA and regulated by the PRA - details about the extent of our regulation by the FCA and PER are available from us on request; has been approved for publication and is distributed in the European Economic Area (EEA) by BoFASE (France), which is authorized by the ACPR and regulated by the ACPR and the AMF; has been considered and distributed in Japan by Merrill Lynch (Japan), a registered securities dealer under the Financial Instruments and Exchange Act in Japan, or its permitted affiliates; is issued and distributed in Hong Kong by Merrill Lynch (Hong Kong) which is regulated by HKSCF, is issued and distributed in Taiwan by Merrill Lynch (Taiwan); is issued and distributed in India by DSP Merrill Lynch (India); and is issued and distributed in Singapore to institutional investors and/or accredited investors (each as defined under the Financial Advisers Regulations) by Merrill Lynch (Singapore) (Company Registration No 1986028830). Merrill Lynch (Singapore) is regulated by MAS. Merrill Lynch Equities (Australia) Limited (ABN 65 006 276 795). AFS License 235132 (MLC) distribute this information in Australia only to ‘Wholesale’ clients as defined by s.761G of the Corporations Act 2001. With the exception of BANA Australia, neither MEA nor any of its affiliates involved in preparing this information is an Authorised Deposit-Taking Institution under the Banking Act 1959 nor regulated by the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority. No approval is required for publication or distribution of this information in Brazil and its local distribution is by Merrill Lynch (Brazil) in accordance with applicable regulations. Merrill Lynch (DIFC) is authorized and regulated by the DFSA. Information prepared and issued by Merrill Lynch (DIFC) is done so in accordance with the requirements of the DFSA conduct of business rules. BAMU DAC (Frankfurt) distributes this information in Germany and is regulated by BaFin, the ECB and the CBI BoFA Securities entities, including BAMU DAC and BoFASE (France), may outsource/delegate the marketing and/or provision of certain research services or aspects of research services to other branches or members of the BoFA Securities group. You may be contacted by a different BoFA Securities entity acting for and on behalf of your service provider where permitted by applicable law. This does not change your service provider. Please use this link http://www.bankofamerica.com/emaildecline/ for further information.

This information has been prepared and issued by BoFA and/or one or more of its non-US affiliates. The author(s) of this information may not be licensed to carry on regulated activities in your jurisdiction and, if not licensed, do not hold themselves out as being able to do so. BoFA and/or MLPF&S is the distributor of this information in the US and accepts full responsibility for
information distributed to BoFA Securities and/or MLFP&AS clients in the US by its non-US affiliates. Any US person receiving this information and wishing to effect any transaction in any security discussed herein should do so through BoFA Securities and/or MLFP&AS and not such foreign affiliates. Hong Kong recipients of this information should contact Merrill Lynch (Asia Pacific) Limited in respect of any matters relating to dealing in securities or provision of specific advice on securities or any other matters arising from, or in connection with, this information. Singapore recipients of this information should contact Merrill Lynch (Singapore) Pte Ltd in respect of any matters arising from, or in connection with, this information.

General Investment Related Disclosures:

Taiwan Readers: Neither the information nor any opinion expressed herein constitutes an offer or a solicitation of an offer to transact in any securities or other financial instrument. No part of this report may be used or reproduced in any form or manner whatsoever in Taiwan by the public or any other person without the express written consent of BoFA Securities.

This document is intended for general distribution to BoFA Securities clients. Neither the information nor any opinion expressed constitutes an offer or an invitation to make an offer, to buy or sell any securities or other financial instrument or any derivative related to such securities or instruments (e.g., options, futures, warrants, and contracts for differences). This document is not intended to provide personal investment advice and it does not take into account the specific investment objectives, financial situation and the particular needs of, and is not directed to, any specific person(s). This document and its content do not constitute, and should not be considered to constitute, investment advice for purposes of ERISA, the US tax code, the Investment Advisers Act or otherwise. Investors should seek financial advice regarding the appropriateness of investing in financial instruments and implementing investment strategies discussed or recommended in this document and should understand that statements regarding future prospects may not be realized. Any decision to purchase or subscribe for securities in any offering must be based solely on existing public information on such security or the information in the prospectus or other offering document issued in connection with such offering, and not on this document.

Securities and other financial instruments referred to herein, or recommended, offered or sold by BoFA Securities, are not insured by the Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation and are not deposits or other obligations of any insured depository institution (including, Bank of America, N.A.). Investments in general and, derivatives, in particular, involve numerous risks, including, among others, market risk, counterparty default risk and liquidity risk. No security, financial instrument or derivative is suitable for all investors. In some cases, securities and other financial instruments may be difficult to value or sell and reliable information about the value or risks related to the security or financial instrument may be difficult to obtain. Investors should note that income from some securities and other financial instruments, if any, may fluctuate and that price or value of such securities and instruments may rise or fall and, in some cases, investors may lose their entire principal investment. Past performance is not necessarily a guide to future performance. Levels and basis for taxation may change.

This report may contain a short-term trading idea or recommendation, which highlights a specific near-term catalyst or event impacting the issuer or the market that is anticipated to have a short-term price impact on the equity securities of the issuer. Short-term trading ideas and recommendations are different from and do not affect a stock's fundamental equity rating, which reflects both a longer term total return expectation and attractiveness for investment relative to other stocks within its Coverage Cluster. Short-term trading ideas and recommendations may be more or less positive than a stock's fundamental equity rating.

BoFA Securities, aware that the implementation of the ideas expressed in this report may depend upon an investor's ability to 'short' securities or other financial instruments and that such action may be limited by regulations prohibiting or restricting 'shorting' in many jurisdictions. Investors are urged to seek advice regarding the applicability of such regulations prior to executing any short idea contained in this report.

Foreign currency rates of exchange may adversely affect the value, price or income of any security or financial instrument mentioned herein. Investors in such securities and instruments, including ADRs, effectively assume currency risk.

UK Readers: The protections provided by the U.K. regulatory regime, including the Financial Services Scheme, do not apply to general to business coordinated by BoFA Securities entities located outside of the United Kingdom.

BoFA's or one of its affiliates is a regular issuer of traded financial instruments linked to securities that may have been recommended in this report. BoFA or one of its affiliates may, at any time, hold a position (long or short) in the securities and financial instruments discussed in this report.

BoFA Securities, through business units other than BoFA Global Research, may have issued and may in the future issue trading ideas or recommendations that are inconsistent with, and reach different conclusions from, the information presented herein. Such ideas or recommendations may reflect different time frames, assumptions, views and analytical methods of the persons who prepared them, and BoFA Securities is under no obligation to ensure that such other trading ideas or recommendations are brought to the attention of any recipient of this information. In the event that the recipient received this information pursuant to a contract between the recipient and BoFA for the provision of research services for a separate fee, and in connection therewith BoFA may be deemed to be acting as an investment adviser, such status relates, if at all, solely to the person with whom BoFA has contracted directly and does not extend beyond the delivery of this report (unless otherwise agreed specifically in writing by BoFA). If such recipient uses the services of BoFA in connection with the sale or purchase of a security referred to herein, BoFA may act as principal for its own account or as agent for another person. BoFA is, and continues to act solely as a broker-dealer in connection with the execution of any transactions, including transactions in any securities referred to herein.

Copyright and General Information:

Copyright 2020 Bank of America Corporation. All rights reserved. iQprofile™, iQmethod™ are service marks of Bank of America Corporation. iQdatabase® is a registered service mark of Bank of America Corporation. This information is prepared for the use of BoFA Securities clients and may not be redistributed, retransmitted or disclosed, in whole or in part, in any form or manner, without the express written consent of BoFA Securities. BoFA Global Research information is distributed simultaneously to internal and client websites and other portals by BoFA Securities and is not publicly-available material. Any unauthorized use or disclosure is prohibited. Receipt and review of this information constitutes your agreement not to redistribute, retransmit, or disclose to others the contents, opinions, conclusion, or information contained herein (including any investment recommendations, estimates or price targets) without first obtaining express permission from an authorized officer of BoFA Securities.

Materials prepared by BoFA Global Research personnel are on public information. Facts and views presented in this material have not been reviewed by, and may not reflect information known to, professionals in other business areas of BoFA Securities, including investment banking personnel. BoFA Securities has established information barriers between BoFA Global Research and certain business units. BoFA Securities does not disclose certain information to, or compensation received from, such issuers. To the extent this material discusses any legal proceedings or issues, it has not been prepared as nor is it intended to express any legal conclusion, opinion or advice. Investors should consult their own legal advisors as to issues of law relating to the subject matter of this material. BoFA Global Research personnel's knowledge of legal proceedings in which any BoFA Securities entity and/or its directors, officers and employees may be plaintiffs, defendants, co-defendants or co-plaintiffs with or involving issuers mentioned in this material is based on public information. Facts and views presented in this material that relate to any such proceedings have not been reviewed by, discussed with, and may not reflect information known to, professionals in other business areas of BoFA Securities in connection with the legal proceedings or matters relevant to such proceedings.

This information has been prepared independently of any issuer of securities mentioned herein and not in connection with any proposed offering of securities or as agent of any issuer of any securities. None of BoFA any of its affiliates or their research analysts has any authority whatsoever to make any representation or warranty on behalf of the issuer(s). BoFA Global Research policy prohibits research personnel from disclosing a recommendation, investment rating, or investment thesis for review by an issuer prior to the publication of a research report containing such rating, recommendation or investment thesis.

Any information relating to the tax status of financial instruments discussed herein is not intended to provide tax advice or to be used by anyone to provide tax advice. Investors are urged to seek tax advice based on their particular circumstances from an independent tax professional.

The information herein (other than disclosure information relating to BoFA Securities and its affiliates) was obtained from various sources and we do not guarantee its accuracy. This information may contain links to third-party websites. BoFA Securities is not responsible for the content of any third-party website or any linked content contained in a third-party website. Content contained on such third-party websites is not part of this information and is not incorporated by reference. The inclusion of a link does not imply any endorsement by or any affiliation with BoFA Securities. Access to any third-party website is at your own risk, and you should always review the terms and privacy policies at third-party websites before submitting any personal information to them. BoFA Securities is not responsible for such terms and privacy policies and expressly disclaims any liability for them.

All opinions, projections and estimates constitute the judgment of the author as of the date of publication and are subject to change without notice. Prices also are subject to change without notice. BoFA Securities, or the obligation to update this information and BoFA Securities, ability to publish information update the subject issuer(s) in the future is subject to applicable quality and other periods. You should therefore assume that BoFA Securities will not update any fact, circumstance or opinion contained herein. Certain outstanding reports or investment opinions relating to securities, financial instruments and/or issuers may no longer be current. Always refer to the most recent research report relating to an issuer prior to making an investment decision.

In some cases, an issuer may be classified as Restricted or may be Under Review or Extended Review. In each case, investors should consider any investment opinion relating to such issuer (or its security and/or financial instruments) to be suspended or withdrawn and should not rely on the analyses and investment opinion(s) pertaining to such issuer (or its securities and/or financial instruments) nor should the analyses or opinion(s) be considered a solicitation of any kind. Sales persons and financial advisors affiliated with BoFA or any of its affiliates may not solicit:
purchases of securities or financial instruments that are Restricted or Under Review and may only solicit securities under Extended Review in accordance with firm policies. Neither BofA Securities nor any officer or employee of BofA Securities accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct, indirect or consequential damages or losses arising from any use of this information.